



2013 THEORY WORKING GROUP

THEORIZING HIERARCHY IN ANARCHY: POLITICAL, ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL PERSPECTIVES

The objective of this working group is to facilitate conversation among scholars engaged in the rapidly growing but disparate effort to theorize and empirically demonstrate the role of hierarchies in the (putatively) anarchic international order. Hierarchies have long been the focus of critical IR scholarship. Faced with the challenge of understanding order in a globalizing world—one now mired in ongoing global economic crisis—a broader range of researchers have now joined critical theorists in examining whether, how, and in what ways hierarchies work within, alongside, or instead of anarchy to organize international politics. Inspired by the idea long advanced by economists and sociologists that stratification may exist under (and in fact may be perpetuated by) conditions of formal equality, IR scholars have undertaken research on the modes and political effects of such stratification in a diversity of issues (from global governance to international political economy and international security); through diverse analytic lenses (including, for instance, realism, liberalism, constructivism, the English school, and feminist and post-colonial theories) that bring to bear insights and methods from diverse traditions (such as historical sociology, rational choice, and political psychology, and psychoanalysis). These diverse efforts have exposed the implication of hierarchies in a whole host of political and moral dynamics and effects in international politics. And yet precisely because of the diverse foci and traditions of these studies, their insights have tended to remain isolated from one another. Indeed, research on hierarchy in world politics often implicitly rests upon and propagates fundamentally different notions of what hierarchies are and what they are made of. By bringing together scholars who approach hierarchy through a variety theoretical lenses and substantive foci, this workshop aims to facilitate the development of a shared conceptual and theoretical vocabulary through which to a) take stock of the significance of hierarchy as an ordering structure in international politics; and b) assess its significance for future IR theorizing about the nature of the international system and world politics more broadly.

GROUP COORDINATORS

Janice Bially Mattern, National University of Singapore

JANICE BIALLY MATTERN is Associate Professor at the Department of Political Science, National University of Singapore. Before joining the National University of Singapore, she was associate professor at Lehigh University. She has also taught at Temple University (Pennsylvania, USA) and Dartmouth College (New Hampshire, USA); and worked as a political risk analyst in New York City and as a policy analyst in Washington, DC. Her current research focuses on the role of international social hierarchies in producing illicit global actors, especially transnational crime networks; and on the role of emotion in the hierarchies that found international order. She is the author of *Ordering International Politics* (Routledge, 2005), and several journal articles and book chapters. Bially Mattern earned her B.A. from the University of Wisconsin-Madison and her M.A., M.Phil, and Ph.D. from Yale University.

Ayşe Zarakol, University of Cambridge

AYŞE ZARAKOL is Lecturer at the University of Cambridge, Department of Politics and International Studies. Previously she was Assistant Professor at Washington and Lee University. She received her B.A. from Middlebury College, VT, and her M.A. and Ph.D. in Political Science from the University of Wisconsin-Madison. Zarakol has an International Affairs Fellowship with the Council on Foreign Relations during the 2012-3 academic year. Her current research focuses on East-West relations in the international system and Turkish foreign policy in comparative perspective. She is the author of *After Defeat: How the East Learned to Live with the West* (Cambridge UP, 2011), as well as several journal articles, book chapters and policy memos.

SCHEDULE
Tuesday, April 2, 2013
PRE-CONFERENCE WORKSHOP | 9:00AM - 6:00PM
Room: Yosemite B, Hilton Union Square

9:00am - 9:30am

Welcome and Introductions: Janice Bially Mattern and Ayse Zarakol
Coffee and tea served

Roundtable 1: Hierarchy, Anarchy, and International Order: Taking Stock of the Literature

Co-Chairs: David Lake and Bud Duvall

9:30 - 10:30am

Participants in this panel will open the discussion by taking stock of the current of state of theorizing about hierarchy in the international system. Key orienting questions include: What are hierarchies? Are they best understood as structures, processes, practices, or some other kind of social formation? (And does it matter? For what does it matter?) What kinds of different hierarchies exist within the international system (e.g., material, social, organizational, biological etc)? What analytic, explanatory, or practical difference follows from these distinctions?

David A. Lake is the Jerri-Ann and Gary E. Jacobs Professor of Social Sciences and Distinguished Professor of Political Science at the University of California, San Diego. He has published widely in international relations theory and international political economy. Lake's most recent book is *Hierarchy in International Relations* (2009). In addition to over seventy scholarly articles and chapters, he is the author of *Power, Protection, and Free Trade: International Sources of U.S. Commercial Strategy, 1887-1939* (1988) and *Entangling Relations: American Foreign Policy in its Century* (1999) and co-editor of ten volumes including *Politics in the New Hard Times: The Great Recession in Comparative Perspective* (2013) and *The Credibility of Transnational NGOs: When Virtue is not Enough* (2012). He is also a co-author of a comprehensive new textbook on *World Politics: Interests, Interactions, and Institutions* (2009, second edition 2013). Lake has served as Research Director for International Relations at the Institute on Global Conflict and Cooperation (1992-1996 and 2000-2001), co-editor of the journal *International Organization* (1997-2001), chair of UCSD's Political Science department (2000-2004), and Acting Dean of Social Sciences at UCSD (2011-12). Since 2006, he has served as Associate Dean of Social Sciences at UCSD. He is the founding chair of the International Political Economy Society, was Program Co-Chair of the Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association (2007), and is past President of the International Studies Association (2010-2011). The recipient of the UCSD Chancellor's Associates Award for Excellence in Graduate Education (2005), he was elected to the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2006 and a fellow at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences in 2008-2009. He received his Ph.D. from Cornell University in 1984 and taught at UCLA from 1983-1992.

Bud Duvall is Professor of Political Science at the University of Minnesota. In recent years, he has worked in the field of critical international relations theory, through a set of four interrelated strands. Some of this research addresses the concept and operation of power (a Cambridge University Press book co-edited with Michael Barnett, 2005, an article in *International Organization*, 2005, and two articles in progress). Another component of this research concerns the role and practice of critical theorizing in international relations--what it means to be a critical theorist (articles in *Millennium: Journal of International Studies*, 2007, on Edward Said, and *Asian Journal of Political Science*, 2006). A third strand pertains to the condition and function of modern sovereignty (an article in *Political Theory*,

2008, a chapter in an edited book on *Europe and Its Boundaries*, 2009, a chapter in an edited book on UFOs, 2010, and a forthcoming article). The fourth aspect of this research revolves around the production of insecurities and the pursuit of security through practices of those who claim sovereign power (a University of Minnesota book co-edited with Jutta Weldes, Mark Laffey, and Hugh Gusterson, 1999, an article in *Review of International Studies*, 2008, and a chapter in an edited book on securing orbital space, 2009). Currently Duvall is examining the implications for modern sovereign power of the changing imaginary of war. He studies how war is being imagined as a violent practice conducted through technologies increasingly distanced from humans acting as armed forces in direct combat-- technologies of space weapons, cyber-warfare, battlefield robotics and drones, and related technologies--and how this emerging "war without humans" can reconfigure the bases of modern rule.

10:30 - 11:00am

Tea and Coffee Break

Roundtable 2: Theorizing Hierarchy under Anarchy

Co-Chairs: Bahar Rumelili, Mark Salter, and Ann Towns

Participants in this panel will examine different avenues for theorizing the role and effects of hierarchy under conditions of formal equality. We aim for a diversity of panelists able to bring insights from social theory, law, sociology and political economy, as well as other relevant disciplines. Key questions include: How do hierarchies (however conceived) relate to other structures, processes, and practices in world politics? How do they affect/constitute/produce/etc. the agents that enact world politics?

11:00am - 12:30pm

Bahar Rumelili is Associate Professor and Jean Monnet Chair at the Department of International Relations, Koc University, Istanbul. Dr. Rumelili has received her PhD degree at the Political Science Department of University of Minnesota in 2002. Her research is situated at the intersection of international relations theory and European integration studies, with particular emphasis on identity, citizenship, and conflict resolution. She is the author of *Constructing Regional Community and Order in Europe and Southeast Asia* (Palgrave, 2007). Her articles have appeared inter alia in the *European Journal of International Relations*, *Review of International Studies*, and *the Journal of Common Market Studies*. She is the 2009 recipient of Turkish Academy of Sciences' Distinguished Young Scientist Award.

Mark B. Salter is a full professor at the School of Political Studies, University of Ottawa. He is editor of "Research Methods in Critical Security Studies" with Can Mutlu, "Mapping Transatlantic Security Relations," "Politics at the Airport" and "Global Policing and Surveillance: borders, security identity" with Elia Zureik. He is the sole author of *Rights of Passage: the passport in international relations and Barbarians and Civilization in International Relations* (also published in Chinese). Recent research appears in *Geopolitics*, *Citizenship Studies*, *International Political Sociology*, *Alternatives*, *Security Dialogue*, *the Journal of Air Transport Management*, and *the Journal of Transportation Security*. He has been an invited expert on risk management, aviation and border security for Canadian and American governments, as well as international think-tanks and organizations. In 2007, he was the recipient of the National Capital Educator's Award and the Excellence in Education Prize at the University of Ottawa. In autumn 2008, he was Visiting Fellow at the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences, and Humanities, Wolfson College, and Visiting Scholar at the Centre of International Studies at the University of Cambridge. He is currently researching "Politics of the Spaces In-between" that connects the theoretical work on states of exception with empirical research on interstitial sites in global politics.

Ann Towns joined the International Programme for Politics and Economics of University West, Sweden, in August of 2010. Before then, she was Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science and

International Relations at the University of Delaware (2007-2010). Between 2004-7 she was a Post-Doctoral Fellowship at the Department of Political Science at Göteborg University, Sweden. She received her Ph.D. in Political Science with a Ph.D. minor in Feminist Studies in 2004 from the University of Minnesota, USA. Her book *Women and States: Norms and Hierarchies in International Society* (Cambridge University Press 2010) was selected as the 2009 honoree of the annual book circle of the International Studies Association – North East convention. Papers and articles drawn from this project have received an APSA Best Paper Award in 2004, a Lee Bennett Best Faculty Paper Award (ISA-NE) in 2009, and an Okin-Young Award in Feminist Political Theory (APSA) in 2010. Recent work has appeared in the *European Journal of International Relations*, the *Journal of Latin American Studies* and *International Organization*.

12:30pm - 1:30pm

Lunch

Roundtable 3: Historicizing Theories of Hierarchy in the Westphalian System

Co-Chairs: Dan Nexon and Shogo Suzuki

Participants in this panel will consider hierarchies in the international system from a historical perspective, borrowing insights from historical sociology, anthropology, postcolonial and postmodern literatures, and structural realism. Key questions include: how have the founding norms of dominant hierarchies changed over time? Are hierarchies in the modern international system fundamentally different from hierarchies which existed throughout history? For instance, is it more stigmatizing to be in a hierarchical relationship in modernity? If so, what are the fundamental logics driving this outcome?

1:30pm - 3:00pm

Dan Nexon has held fellowships at Stanford University's Center for International Security and Cooperation and at the Ohio State University's Mershon Center for International Studies. During 2009-2010 he worked in the U.S. Department of Defense as a Council on Foreign Relations International Affairs Fellow. Professor Nexon specializes in the comparative-historical analysis of international politics, international-relations theory, and international security. His current research focuses on statecraft and instruments of power politics, particularly in the context of unequal inter-state relations. Professor Nexon's work covers issues in international-relations theory, American foreign policy, power politics, the politics of religious contention, and the relationship between popular culture and world politics. He is the author of *The Struggle for Power in Early Modern Europe: Religious Conflict, Dynastic Empires, and International Change* (Princeton University Press, 2009), which won the International Security Studies Section (ISSS) Best Book Award for 2010. His articles have appeared in the *American Political Science Review*, *Dialogue IO*, *European Journal of International Relations*, *International Studies Perspectives*, *International Studies Review*, *International Studies Quarterly*, *the Review of International Studies*, *the Review of International Political Economy*, and *World Politics*. He is also, entirely by default, one of the world's leading authorities on the nexus between Harry Potter and International Relations.

Shogo Suzuki is Lecturer in Politics at the University of Manchester, UK. This year he is a Visiting Associate Professor at the Department of Political Science, University of Copenhagen. He is the author of *Civilization and Empire: China and Japan's Encounter with European International Society* (Routledge, 2009), as well as articles that have appeared in *European Journal of International Relations*, *Third World Quarterly*, *Pacific Affairs* and *The Pacific Review*.

3:00pm - 3:30pm

Tea and Coffee Break

Roundtable 4: Political, Moral and Practical Implications of Hierarchies

Co-Chairs: Rebecca Adler-Nissen and Charlotte Epstein

This panel will explore the effects of political, economic and social stratification on outcomes in the international system. How does power operate in hierarchies? Participants are encouraged to discuss their empirical work relevant to the major questions of the working group. Key questions include through what processes or mechanisms do hierarchies affect international politics? Do, and how do, hierarchies 'mobilize' agency or inaugurate new dynamics of political action?

3:30pm - 5:00pm

Rebecca Adler-Nissen is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science at the University of Copenhagen. Her research focuses on international political sociology and participant observation (especially diplomacy, sovereignty and European integration). She is the author of *Diplomacy, Sovereignty and European Integration* (Cambridge University Press, forthcoming) and co-editor of *Postcolonial Sovereignty Games and European Integration: The EU's Overseas Countries and Territories* (Routledge, 2012) and *Sovereignty Games: Instrumentalizing State Sovereignty in Europe and Beyond* (Palgrave, 2008).

Charlotte Epstein is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Government and International Relations at the University of Sydney. She is French born in Kenya and centrally interested in the role of language in international politics. On that topic she has authored *The Power of Words in International Relations* (MIT Press, runner up to the 2009 ISA Sprout Award) and several articles (notably in *European Journal of International Relations* and *International Political Sociology*). She read International Relations at the University of Cambridge (PhD, Mphil) after reading Philosophy and Languages at l'Université de Paris-Sorbonne (Maîtrise and two BAs). Before coming to the University of Sydney she was a Georges Lurcy Visiting Scholar at the UC Berkeley Political Science Department. She is currently working on the theoretical foundations underpinning conceptions of agency, subjectivity and discourse in international relations, as well as a multi-authored collaborative project around rethinking 'norms' in IR. Her articles from these projects have recently been published or are forthcoming in journals such as *International Organization* and *International Studies Perspectives*.

Roundtable 5: Summary--Hierarchy, Anarchy, and International Order Revisited

Co-Chairs: Janice Bially Mattern and Ayşe Zarakol

In an open discussion we will explore points convergence and divergence between different conceptions and theories of hierarchy with respect to a) how we understand the political ethical and practical significance of hierarchy for international orders, past and present; and b) the significance (or insignificance) of hierarchy for future IR theorizing about international politics. On this basis we will collectively identify the key themes for future research and explore the possibility of collaborative projects in these veins.

5:00pm - 6:00pm

FOLLOW-UP SESSIONS

Friday, April 5, 2012

Room: Franciscan A, Hilton Union Square

10:30pm - 12:15pm

FB18 Roundtable: Theorizing Hierarchies in International Relations I

1:45pm - 3:30pm

FC18 Roundtable: Theorizing Hierarchies in International Relations II