

Report on the ISA 2016 Catalytic Grant Workshop
The Instrumental Uses of Norms in International Relations
15 March 2016, Atlanta

Organizers: Jennifer M. Dixon and Jennifer L. Erickson

Report Date: 11 April 2016

Overview of Workshop Goals

This workshop brought together a diverse group of scholars to discuss the state of and gaps in our understanding of the instrumental uses of norms, along with the implications and limits of instrumental-normative action.

The workshop had three goals. First, it sought to establish and deepen dialogues among scholars whose work relates to the instrumental uses of norms. Second, it sought to engage this group of scholars in a discussion of two proposed forms of instrumentalism. Finally, the workshop aimed to unpack some of the ways in which logics of appropriateness are intertwined with logics of consequences in the conduct of global governance and international relations, and shed further light on the range and complexity of norms' influence on world politics and state behavior.

Summary of Workshop

The workshop took place as scheduled on March 15, 2016. All participants attended and participated in the lively discussions throughout the day.

The opening session of the workshop sought to articulate its goals and engage in a general discussion of the concepts and theoretical framework laid out in the organizers' memo for the workshop. The memo defined instrumental-normative action and described its two main types (persuasive and coercive instrumentalism).

In the workshop, we sought to set forward a clear central concept to acknowledge, bring together, and move forward work in this tradition and to capture different processes of norm development (including the actors and strategies involved) and the consequences for international norms themselves. In doing so, we hoped to begin to bring together – rather than conceptually separate – the logics of appropriateness and consequences in international politics. This, we argue, can better account for international action and better explain the processes and outcomes of international politics.

The workshop memos explored different aspects of the instrumental uses of norms in world politics and applied our proposed concepts to different empirical issue areas and cases. The memos were organized into three panels, with discussants for each (see workshop schedule attached). The discussants' comments, along with comments and questions from the rest of the

workshop participants, provided individual feedback for authors on their memos, and helped illuminate theoretical and methodological challenges for the project as a whole.

In the wrap-up discussion at the end of the workshop, the organizers summarized four common themes in the memos and discussions, as well as areas we wanted to push the authors to explore as they revise their memos: (1) What constitutes “instrumental” action in international politics?; (2) What are the consequences of instrumental-normative action for the norms themselves, as well as for the targets and agents of instrumental action?; (3) What is the role of power in various processes and cases of instrumental-normative action?; and (4) Who is the audience for instrumental-normative action and what is their role? We also asked each participant to summarize briefly what they saw as the common theme or themes of the workshop and what work they thought needed to be done to move the project forward.

Planned Next Steps

Since the workshop, we have begun to informally assess the interest of journal editors in doing a special issue or section of an issue on the workshop theme. We have to decide how to organize such an issue or section, as well as who will want to continue to be involved, but we anticipate moving forward with the initial steps for a special issue within the next several months.

In the meantime, we plan to organize and submit proposals for 2-3 follow-up panels at next year’s ISA meeting, to include those workshop participants who are interested in joining a special issue. We have also organized a roundtable that will be held at the upcoming APSA meeting with some of the workshop participants and some other scholars who had expressed an interest but who did not attend ISA this year.

Finally, we plan to apply for a grant from the Boston College Institute of Liberal Arts to run a follow-up workshop in order to give the authors an opportunity to expand their memos into full-length papers that speak coherently to one another and are in close conversation with our thematic paper, with the goal of having a set of polished, high-quality papers for a special journal issue.

Detailed Accounting of Expenses

Budget Item	Total Amount
Lodging (1 night lodging for 18 participants @ up to \$202 each)	\$ 3,154.60
Meeting Room Rental	200
Coffee Service (3 gallons (@ 1 gal = 16 cups) x \$90/gallon)	270
Boxed Lunches (18 lunches @ \$40/person)	720
A/V Equipment	
Projector Setup	350
Wireless Internet for the Meeting Room (for 2 devices @ \$32/device)	64
Power (17 @ \$16/device)	272
Participant Per Diem [@ \$75 / participant x18]	1,350
<hr/> TOTAL Amount Spent	<hr/> \$ 6,380.60

Coordinators:

Jennifer M. Dixon, Villanova University
Jennifer L. Erickson, Boston College

Participants:

Phillip M. Ayoub, Drexel University
Michal Ben-Josef Hirsch, Wellesley College
Clifford Bob, Duquesne University
Adam Bower, University of St. Andrews
Joshua W. Busby, University of Texas-Austin
Zoltán I. Búzás, Drexel University
David Capie, Victoria University of Wellington
Jonathan T. Chow, University of Macau
Kate Cronin-Furman, Stanford University
Tanisha Fazal, University of Notre Dame
Courtney Fung, University of Hong Kong
John A. Gentry, Georgetown University
Daniel H. Nexon, Georgetown University
Rebecca Sanders, University of Cincinnati

Observers:

Alan Bloomfield, University of New South Wales
Kathrin Kranz, University of Notre Dame

Workshop Schedule
The Instrumental Uses of Norms in World Politics

Date and time: Tuesday, 15 March 2016, 9:30 am - 5:30 pm

Location: Atlanta Hilton, Room 303

9:30–10:15 Introductions and framing discussion, led by Jennifer Dixon & Jennifer Erickson

10:15–10:45 Coffee break

10:45–12:15 **Panel 1: Fundamental Questions about the Instrumental Uses of Norms**

Daniel H. Nexon (Chair and Discussant)

- **Adam Bower**, *J'accuse!* The Social Power of Accusations in World Politics
- **Joshua W. Busby**, Who Cares About Norms? Thoughts on Target Vulnerability
- **Tanisha Fazal**, What is the International Community?
- **John A. Gentry**, Strategic Uses of Norms in Violent Conflicts: A Taxonomy

12:15–1:15 Lunch

1:15–2:45 **Panel 2: Norm Contestation and Instrumental Compliance**

Jonathan T. Chow (Chair and Discussant)

- **Phillip M. Ayoub** & Agnès Chetaille, European Poles and Polish Patriots: Movement/Countermovement Dynamics and Instrumental Framing around New Norms
- **Michal Ben-Josef Hirsch**, Motivation Broadening: States' International Motivations for Establishing a TRC
- **Courtney Fung**, Creative Resister in Action: China's Traditionalist Sovereignty Norms at the UN Security Council

2:45–3:15 Coffee break

3:15–4:45 **Panel 3: Instrumentalism at the Law-Norm Nexus**

Clifford Bob (Chair and Discussant)

- **Zoltán I. Búzás**, An Evasion Model of Norm Resistance: Violating International Norms under the Cover of the Law
- **David Capie**, Freedom of Navigation Norms and US-China Rivalry
- **Kate Cronin-Furman**, Exploitable Ambiguity: The Effects of Uncertainty about Human Rights Enforcement
- **Rebecca Sanders**, The Golden Shield: Legalized Rule Evasion in the “Global War on Terror”

4:45–5:30 Wrap-up discussion led by Jennifer Dixon and Jennifer Erickson