

Workshop Report¹

"Gendered Peace: The Problematique of Gender Analyses in Peace Research"

Held on March 15, 2011, at the Montreal ISA Convention

8:30 AM — 5:00 PM

(Salon 3, Sheraton)

Principal Organiser and Contact Person:

Dr. Swati Parashar

(Chair, Peace Studies Section, ISA, 2010-2012)

Dept. of Politics and Public Administration

University of Limerick, Ireland

(swatiparashar@ul.ie; swatiparashar@gmail.com)

Phone: 00-353-852440504

Participants:

1. Prof. Christine Sylvester (Lancaster University UK/ Gothenburgh University Sweden)
2. Dr. Swati Parashar (University of Limerick, Ireland)
3. Dr. Catia C. Confortini (Wellesley College, US)
4. Dr. Hans Günter Brauch (Free University of Berlin, Germany)
5. Dr. Ursula Oswald Spring (National University of Mexico, Mexico)
6. Dr. Serena Eréndira Serrano Oswald (Mexican Council of Science, Mexico)
7. Dr. Elina Penttinen (University of Helsinki, Finland)
8. Prof. Luke M. Ashworth (University of Limerick)
9. Dr. Jennifer A. Davis (National Defense Intelligence College, US)
10. Dr. Yeshi Choedon (Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, India)

One participant, Dr. Soumita Basu from Kenyon College, US, was unable to attend due to a visa refusal to Canada. We felt that this was most unfortunate as a valued colleague and scholar, working in the US, had been denied a visa to attend the convention in Canada. Her co-author Dr. Catia Confortini presented her views at the workshop.

¹ The workshop programme and participants' details are attached: See Appendix 1 and 2

Left to Right: Christine, Jennifer, Luke, Catia, Swati, Elina, Erendira, Hans Gunter, Ursula, Yeshi

Background:

Gender as an analytical category has not been adequately applied in cases of war and peace. Moreover, stereotypes of gender (women as peaceful, men as violent) have often been deployed in the study of conflicts and especially in peace research. This workshop aimed to begin conversations on the problematique of gender analyses in peace research. We wished to explore, through the works of participating activists and scholars, the challenges and opportunities that exist in applying gender as an analytical category in making sense of conflicts and post conflict peace initiatives. The workshop engaged with theoretical aspects of gendered peace and gendered violence, but also critically examined the gender, peace and security initiatives of the UN. The participants were interested in scholarly insights on how gender informs peace studies and how it can both perpetuate stereotypes as well as challenge existing norms of post conflict peace.

The participants of this workshop are well established practitioners and scholars in the field of feminist IR and conflict and peace studies who have addressed important gender questions in their research. The workshop was also an attempt to bring scholars from different regions (India, Mexico,

US, UK, Ireland Germany and Finland) together on a common platform to discuss issues of common concern and we expected an honest exchange of ideas and a wide range of conversations.

This initiative was first of its kinds undertaken by the Peace Studies Section and we hoped to not only propose a panel for ISA 2012, but also publish the proceedings of the workshop in a relevant edited book. It is our belief, that this workshop will set the trend for more conversations on the intersections of gender with peace and conflict studies, which is much needed at this critical juncture when many societies are engaged in post conflict peace processes, and several international and regional conventions have attempted to mainstream gender in peace, conflict and security issues.

Proceedings:

The workshop started with a brief background by Swati Parashar followed by a stimulating and provocative keynote address by feminist IR scholar, Christine Sylvester. Sylvester suggested that most feminist peace theorising had occurred outside International Relations (IR) with the works of Sarah Ruddick, Birgit Brock-Utne, Betty Reardon, Linda Forcey, Elise Boulding, Adrienne Harris, Ynestra King, Nancy Hartsock, Shirley Ardener. Feminist IR on the other hand had been focussed on security as a gendered concept and practice in foreign policy, not on peace per se. Sylvester also pointed out that Peace Studies "seems still in the margins, owing to (erroneous) perception that it is a hippy holdover, the lingering land of idealism in IR in a rough world". She suggested that with IR now affected by camp structure than hierarchy, Security Studies bridged most camps including war and peace studies. She raised important questions about how feminist peace studies can study peace with/out studying wars, about inter-feminist relations where certain kinds of feminists are rendered insecure by those feminists who argue about cultural relativism and about the issue of agency in feminist peace works. A discussion that followed the keynote address seemed to be focused on the issue of camps and where peace studies and gender may have failed each other.

Session one discussed gender and peace issues within the framework of international organizations such as the UN. Confortini and Choedon raised questions about the successful implementation of the UN Security Council Resolution 1325 (on women, peace and security) and the UN's Peace Keeping operations. They suggested the need for more scrutiny of these provisions and highlighted several problems in their local implementation. Spring talked about Human, Gender and Environmental (HUGE) Peace, which was essential for a comprehensive approach to peace. She highlighted HUGE peace in the context of the developing world. The discussion was centered on problems of implementation of UN initiatives and on a need to recognize the shortcoming of UNSC Resolution 1325 and the Peace Keeping operations, which lacked gender sensitive training and personnel.

Session two looked at security and peace through three presentations. Serrano talked about engendering security and its potential for peace studies. Penttinen addressed 'positivity' as a human value in complex security environments, which would look beyond problem identifying and solving approaches while Hans Gunter raised questions about the deficits of gender analysis in security research. During discussions it was highlighted that Feminist Security Studies had achieved a lot in the last 5 years or so. Feminist Security Studies have now included, above all, the study of wars and

women's violence in particular which was critical to address in peace studies, as Sylvester had suggested in her keynote. But what emerged was also perhaps a need for greater conversation between Feminist Security Studies and Peace Studies. This session was an excellent precursor to the next session on gender, wars and violence.

The final session addressed issues of violence and wars. Parashar (in her co-authored paper with Megan MacKenzie) raised issues about feminist theorizing of violence as critical to understanding everyday violence that affects peace processes, discursive violence that takes away from the analysis of the real experiences of violence and the role of violence in emancipatory projects. Ashworth, drew attention to feminism and the criticism of collective security in the inter war years in Europe. He particularly raised concerns about the writing out of women and the early history of feminism in IR by the realist ascendancy after 1950. Davis brought in her experiences of working at the National Defence Intelligence College and her direct engagement with policy circles to talk about her project on the impact of conflict on female child soldiers. The focus of this session and the discussions was on gendered violence/wars and their impact on everyday life and peace politics. Participants raised concerns about how violence was a domain feminist peace scholarship needed to concern itself with, because absence of war or a period of peace does not always mean an absence of violence.

Overall the discussions were stimulating and refreshing because of conversations we managed to have between two groups (Sylvester's ref. to camps) in the workshop: One whose works are within feminist security studies and feminism and war, and the other who specifically work on gender and peace studies. There seemed to a general view that even our citations did not reflect that we were following the work of the 'other' camp and especially the new research that was emerging. We also agreed that this workshop was only a preliminary indication of the lack of conversation between feminist IR / feminist security studies and peace scholars. A series of such workshops, conferences and publication projects were required to have meaningful scholarly and policy engagements with intersections that map feminist research and peace studies.

Follow-up:

As an immediate follow up we have decided to propose a round table on the *problematics of gendering peace* at the next ISA convention in San Diego (2012). For this round table we propose to bring together 3 Feminist IR scholars and 3 Peace Studies scholars. The purpose of this round table will be to further the conversations from the workshop, this time through established scholars in both fields to share their insights. We believe that this round table will mark those intersections of peace studies and feminist research that we discussed in the workshop as essential for a more meaningful discourse around gendering peace.

One suggestion is also to explore if we can use the innovative as well as regular panel space (within Peace Studies Quota) of the ISA to organise brainstorming on gendered aspects of specific conflicts and invite scholars and practitioners to share their ideas. So each year we take up one region/conflict and address gendered aspects of that conflict in greater details.

Our long term follow up will be to organise a call for papers for an edited volume on the problematic of gendering peace. A proposal will be submitted to Routledge by November 2011. By the time we

meet for the San Diego Convention, we will have a publication plan and the call for papers will have gone out. We hope to keep ISA informed about this.

We, the participants, would also like to place on record our thanks to the ISA HQ for giving us this grant and especially to Brittany McCain and Jeanne White for their support in organising and coordinating logistics for the workshop.

Appendix 1: Workshop Programme

Introduction to the workshop (8.30-8.45 AM)

Swati Parashar

Keynote: Christine Sylvester (8.45-9.15 AM)

The Problematique of 'Gendering' Peace

Discussant: Luke Ashworth (9.15-9.30AM)

Q and A (9.30-10 AM)

Coffee/Tea Break (10-10.15AM)

Session 1: The UN 'En-gendering' Peace

1. Weakest 'P' in the 1325 Pod?: Realizing Conflict Prevention through Security Council

Resolution 1325 (10.15-10.35 AM)

Catia C. Confortini

2. Integrating Gender Perspective into UN Peace Operations: Necessities and Challenges

Yeshe Choedon (10.35-10.55 AM)

3. Human, Gender and Environmental Peace: A HUGE peace

Ursula Oswald Spring (10.55-11.15 AM)

Discussant: Elina Penttinen (11.15-11.30 AM)

Q and A (11.30-12 PM)

Lunch: 12-1 PM

Session 2: Security and Peace

1. Engendering Security: A Potential for Peace Studies

Erindira Serrano (1-1.20 PM)

2. Positivity as method for incorporating values of human security and gender in complex security environments. (1.20-1.40 PM)

Elina Penttinen

3. Security in peace research and security studies: deficits on gender issues? (1.40-2 PM)

Hans Gunter

Discussant : Ursula Oswald Spring (2.-2.15 PM)

Q and A: (2.15-2.45 PM)

Coffee/Tea Break (2.45-3 PM)

Session 3: Feminism, Conflict and Peace Research

1. A Tragic Coming of Age: The Impacts of Conflict on Female Child Soldiers

Jennifer A. Davis (3 – 3.20 PM)

2. Making Feminist Sense of Political Violence

Swati Parashar (3.20 – 3.40 PM)

3. Feminism and the Criticism of Collective Security

Luke Ashworth (3.40- 4 PM)

Discussant: Christine Sylvester (4- 4.15 PM)

Q and A and Open discussion about future course of action among all participants to be led by Christine Sylvester (4.15-5PM)

Workshop concludes at 5 PM

Appendix 2: Bios of Participants

1. **Christine Sylvester** is Professor of International Relations and Development at Lancaster University, UK. She has served as the Kerstin Hesselgren Chair, Department of Global Studies, University of Gothenburg for 2010-2011. She is being honoured by the Feminist Theory and Gender Studies Section, International Studies Association (2011) in a special panel dedicated to her for her contributions to the field and for her mentoring. She was awarded the Susan S. Northcutt Award, International Studies Association, 2009 and named one of Fifty Key Thinkers in International Relations, Martin Griffiths, Steven Roach, M. Scott Solomon, eds. (Routledge, 2008). She has held academic positions at the Institute of Social Studies (ISS) in The Hague Netherlands, the Australian National University and at Northern Arizona University. She has had visiting academic positions in Lesotho, Zimbabwe, Finland, Belgium, the UK and at the United Nations University in Tokyo. She has served as Vice-President of the International Studies Association (USA) in 2004-5 and was Professorial Research Associate at the University of London, School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), from 2004-2006, after spending the previous year there as Leverhulme Professor of International Relations. She is on the editorial boards of the *European Journal of International Relations*, *International Studies Review*, *Alternatives*, *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, *Borderlands ejournal*, and the *Australasian Review of African Studies* (among others). She has also conducted development-related consultancies in Australia, Netherlands, Thailand, Indonesia, Zimbabwe, and Kenya and international relations consultancies in Finland, Austria, New Zealand, Korea, and Spain.
2. **Swati Parashar** (PhD Lancaster University) is Lecturer of Feminist International Relations and Development at the University of Limerick, Ireland. Her work focuses on gender, 'terrorisms', conflicts and development issues in South Asia. She is the editor of *Maritime Counter Terrorism: A Pan Asian Perspective* (2007) and co editor (with Wilson John) of *Terrorism in South Asia: Implications for South Asia* (2005). She is the author of "Feminist IR and Women Militants: Case Studies from South Asia" in *Cambridge Review of International Affairs* (2009); and "Women in Militant Movements: The (Un)comfortable Silences and Discursive Strategies" in Erika Svedberg and Annica Kronsell (eds.), *Gender and War: Feminist Institutional perspectives on militaries and peacekeeping* (2011). She is the co-author (with Christine Sylvester) of "The contemporary Mahabharata and the many Draupadis: bringing gender to critical terrorism studies," in Richard Jackson, Marie Breen Smyth and Jeroen Gunning, (eds.), *Critical Terrorism Studies: A New Research Agenda* (2009).
3. **Yeshi Choedon** is Associate Professor in International Organization Centre for International Politics, Organization and Disarmament (CIPOD), School of International Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi since 2004. Her Ph.D. thesis was on "China, the United Nations and Major Conflict Situations in Asia". From October 1988 to March 2004, she worked as Lecturer and later as Reader in Political Science and International Relations at the Sikkim Government College, Gangtok. She was awarded the UGC Career Award from 1995 to 1998 and was a DAAD Fellow at Free University, Berlin in 1997. She attended and presented papers at the World Congress on Human Rights, New Delhi in December 1990 and he has been frequently attending international seminar on Tibetan Studies. She has also attended and presented papers at the XVth World Congress of International Political Science Association in 1994. Dr Choedon has attended and participated in numerous other seminars, conferences and workshops in India and abroad. Dr Choedon's research interests are in the field of peace, security, democratization and human rights. She teaches M.Phil. courses on

'United Nations and Global Problems' and "Theoretical Issues in International Organization". She visited New York, USA for field work for her Ph.D. and Washington DC, USA for field work for a research project on "US-China Relations: Human Rights Dimensions", in July 1998. She is going to be attached to the University of Illinois at Urbana Champaign for eight months from August 2010 as a Fulbright Fellow.

4. **Lucian M. Ashworth** is senior lecturer and former Head of the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Limerick in Ireland. His main area of research interest is the history of International Relations theory. His publications on this subject include three books, of which the most recent, *International Relations Theory and the Labour Party: Intellectuals and Policy Making 1918-1945*, was published by IB Tauris in 2007. He is currently working on a book on the history of international thought for Pearson.
5. **Ursula Oswald Spring** is Professor and researcher at the National University of Mexico, First Chair on Social Vulnerability at the United Nation University, former President of IPRA, and former minister of Environmental Development in the State of Morelos *1992/1998. She is the coordinator of gender studies at UNAM.
6. **Catla C. Confortini** holds a PhD in IR from the University of Southern California. Her dissertation, ("Imaginative Identification: Feminist Critical Methodology in the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, 1945-1975") received the Peace and Justice Studies Association's 2009 Best Dissertation Award. At the intersection of feminism, peace studies and international relations, her research focuses on women's peace movements and their theoretical practices. Her work is published in *Peace and Change*, *International Politics*, *The International Feminist Journal of Politics* and several edited volumes. Starting in September 2010, she will teach for the Peace and Justice Studies Program at Wellesley College.
7. **Jennifer A. Davis** is a faculty member at the National Defense Intelligence College, where she teaches the transnational threats curriculum. Her areas of expertise are war crimes and human rights, with a particular focus on child soldiering. She recently finished her dissertation on child soldiering at the George Washington University, examining why states change practice on child soldiering to comply with international humanitarian law. In addition to her research on child soldiers, she is also developing a paper on piracy and its current status under international law.
8. **Serena Eréndira Serrano Oswald** (México) PhD in Social Anthropology at the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM). She holds a BA Hons in Political Studies and History from the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), and an MSc in Social Psychology from the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) –both at the University of London. She is currently working for the Mexican Council of Science, preparing for a postdoctoral fellowship in Social Psychology and finishing her second masters' programme in Family Therapy. She teaches courses in social sciences both at undergraduate and postgraduate level, has helped organise 5 congresses at international level and 8 at national level, and has given papers in 25 national and 16 international congresses. Her particular areas of interest are gender studies, identity, social representations, migration, peace and security, regional development and the social and cultural construction of motherhood. Previously she worked for a research project on HIV- AIDS and migration for CENSIDA and CONACyT, and translated into Spanish the book *Globalization and Environmental Challenges: Reconceptualising Security in the 21st Century and Everyday*

Discourse and Common Sense: The Theory of Social Representations (Wagner and Hayes). She has worked extensively as researcher, consultant, therapist and community facilitator, as well as in women- related projects for the pharmaceutical industry in Mexico. She is founder of Benguna Bee Foundation, and was assistant editor for the Encyclopaedia on Life Support Systems (EOLSS), 2003-5.

9. **Hans Günter Brauch** (Germany): Dr. phil. habil, Adj. Prof. (Privatdozent) at the Faculty of Political Science and Social Sciences, Free University of Berlin; since 2005 fellow at the Institute on Environment and Human Security of the United Nations University (UNU-EHS) in Bonn; since 1987 chairman of Peace Research and European Security Studies (AFES-PRESS). He was guest professor of international relations at the universities of Frankfurt on Main, Leipzig and Greifswald and at the teachers training college in Erfurt. From 1976-1989 he was research associate at Heidelberg and Stuttgart universities, a research fellow at Harvard and Stanford University and he was also teaching at the universities of Darmstadt, Tübingen, Stuttgart and Heidelberg.
10. **Elina Penttinen** (Phd) is currently working as a lecturer in International Relations in the University of Lapland, faculty of social sciences. Her current research interests involve research on philosophy and ethic of civilian crisis management. She is currently working on book manuscript with the original title "Joy and International Relations: a new methodology" in which she develops new methodology by engaging in discussion on the philosophical implications of theory of quantum mechanics on the nature of nature and nature of being and proposes a new methodology which can be accountable for the joy experienced in material reality, even if unexpected by IR theory. Her recent publications include "Enhancement of expertise in civilian crisis management: positivity as key toward personal dedication for the comprehensive approach" *Civilian crisis management studies*, CMC Finland (2010) and Penttinen Elina (2010) "Feminine Care and the Nordic Woman in Peacekeeping" in Annica Kronsell and Erika Svedberg (eds) *Gender and the War Question*. Part of the series in *Intersectional Gender Studies. European and Transnational Feminist Perspectives*. Routledge: London.