

## **Final report: Health Inequalities and Global Justice**

**Prepared by: Christine Straehle and Patti Tamara Lenard**

**March 15, 2011**

### **The workshop:**

We ran our ISA supported workshop at McGill University on March 15, 2011 between 8:45am and 5:45pm. Over the course of the day, 9 scholars presented papers, all of which had been pre-circulated, and 4 discussants offered pre-prepared comments on these papers. The papers were organized into four distinct panels: 1) responsibility and health inequalities, 2) boundaries and health inequalities, 3) globalization and health inequalities, and 4) vulnerability, humanitarianism and health inequalities.

The goal of the workshop was to bring together philosophers and social scientists to delve into the difficult moral questions that emerge from an in-depth consideration of global health inequalities. We aimed to discuss which principles should guide us in thinking about when health inequalities are objectionable, and when they are, who is responsible for ameliorating them. Our goal was then to consider the effect of deploying these principles in relation to several specific issues that have negative effects on health outcomes in developing nations, including the out-migration of medical professionals, patent regulation of life-saving drugs, the gendered effects of global health policy, and so on. The workshop was very fruitful in this regard. Our discussions were extremely productive, and we believe the publication that will emerge (see below) will be a valuable addition to academic scholarship.

### *The papers presented were these:*

Garrett Wallace Brown, University of Sheffield, Global Health Inequality and the Demands of Cosmopolitan Global Justice

Mira Johri, Ryoa Chung and Ted Schrecker, Université de Montréal; Université de Montréal; University of Ottawa, Global health and national borders

Angela Kaida, Simon Fraser University, Women and HIV: Our collective moral obligation to improve the health of HIV-affected women and children in developing countries

Yukiko Asada, Dalhousie University, Exploring a Sufficiency View of Health Equity: Applying the Capability Approach Conceptually and Poverty Analysis Methodologically

Phillip Cole, University of Wales, Westport, 'Illegal' Immigrants and Access to Health Care

Lisa Eckenwiler, George Mason University, An ecological conception of global health equity

Ted Schrecker, University of Ottawa, Cartographies of obligation: the global marketplace and global health ethics

Christine Straehle, University of Ottawa, Health Care Migration, Vulnerability and Individual Agency

Patti Tamara Lenard, University of Ottawa, Treating inequality in health care access as a humanitarian disaster

Ryoa Chung and Matthew R. Hunt, University of Montreal; McMaster /University of Montreal, Health inequalities, vulnerability and humanitarian crises

*The discussants were:*

Pierre-Yves Néron, Université de Montréal

Anna Drake, Queen's University

Sarah Wiebe, University of Ottawa

Adina Preda, Université de Montréal

*Our two graduate student "rapporteurs" were:*

Kate Wood (University of Ottawa)

Cathy Nguyen (University of Ottawa)

Each presenter introduced their paper for 10 minutes and discussants also spoke for 10 minutes. Each session included a minimum of 30 minutes for discussion.

The rapporteurs were responsible for taking notes during the sessions to ensure that we have a full record of our discussions as we proceed to publication (see below).

The discussions were fruitful and in the final wrap-up session, Christine Straehle (University of Ottawa) presented an overview of the themes that emerged over the course of our day: 1) the role of the state versus global institutions in distributing resources that are essential to remedying global health inequalities; 2) the challenges of defining health and the relevance of context in determining health's content; 3) the challenges posed by attempting to define what "justice" in health or access to health care consists in; and 4) the difficulties in identifying the source of our duties to remedy global health inequalities.

### **Future publication plans:**

As we indicated in our initial proposal, we simultaneously submitted our grant proposal to ISA and a book proposal to Edinburgh University Press's series *Studies in Global Justice and Human Rights*. The proposal continues to be progressing through the review process. We have been informed that two very positive reviews of the proposal have been received and that the proposal will be discussed at the meeting by the full editorial committee at the Press on April 25<sup>th</sup>. The editor with whom we are working, Thom Brooks, has indicated his strong support for the volume, and we are confident that we will be able to go ahead.

In light of that, we have invited contributors to submit their workshop papers to us by July 1<sup>st</sup>, after which we will compose an introduction to the volume. We aim to submit the full volume for review by the end of July.

As indicated above, 9 papers were presented at the workshop. Of those, we will include 7 in the volume. We have invited several others, who are experts on the theme of global health inequalities, to contribute pieces to round out the volume. The scholars we have invited, and who have agreed, to contribute to the volume are: Eszter Kollar (John Cabot University), Nicole Hassoun (Carnegie Mellon University), Daniel Haussman (University of Wisconsin), Iwao Hirose (McGill University).

### **Future ISA plans**

At the end of the workshop, we also discussed the possibility of participants to propose at least one panel for ISA 2012. This suggestions found widespread support and the organizers have promised to propose panels in due time before the ISA panel proposal deadline in July 2011.

### Detailed Accounting of Budget expenses

We are asking for the following expenses to be reimbursed. All expenses are in accordance with the originally proposed budget submitted with the workshop proposal.

ALL EXPENSES ARE ACCOMPANIED BY RECEIPTS AND ARE LISTED IN ORDER OF THE RECEIPTS SUBMITTED.

The first item (I) is a list of overall expenses (Budget break-down); the second item is a list of reimbursements to be sent to individual participants (II). **ALL EXPENSES ARE IN US DOLLARS.**

#### **I Budget breakdown**

|   |                     |
|---|---------------------|
| <b>Room rental – Faculty club McGill</b> (see Bill McGill Faculty Club)                         | US\$ 100.00         |
| <b>Lunch for participants, discussants and rapporteurs</b><br>(see Bill McGill Faculty Club)    | US\$ 594.00         |
| <b>Breakfast and two breaks</b> (see Bill Classic Fare – 3 bills) for all attendees             | US\$ 855.02         |
| <b>Accommodation</b> for 2 nights for 2 participants from outside Canada/US<br>(Cole and Brown) | US\$ 667.33         |
| <b>Accommodation</b> for 1 night for 5 participants from Canada/US                              | US\$ 772.54         |
| <b>Per diems</b> for 1 day for participants from Canada/US                                      | US\$ 675.00         |
| <b>Per diems</b> for 2 days for 2 participants from outside Canada/US                           | US\$ 300.00         |
| <hr/>   |                     |
| <b>TOTAL:</b>   | <b>US\$ 3963.89</b> |



## Workshop Reimbursements

Chair: Christine Straehle

| Participants                   | Hotel Accommodation | Per Diem (IF APPL) | Misc. Approved Costs | Total Reimb.   |
|--------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------|
| Yukiko Asada                   | 162.89              | 75.00              |                      | 237.89         |
| Garrett Brown                  | 287.33              | 150.00             |                      | 437.33         |
| Ryoo Chung                     |                     | 75.00              |                      | 75.00          |
| Phillip Cole                   | 380.00              | 150.00             |                      | 530.00         |
| Nicole Hassoun                 | N/A                 | N/A                | N/A                  | N/A            |
| Matthew Hunt                   |                     | 75.00              |                      | 75.00          |
| Mira Johri                     |                     | 75.00              |                      | 75.00          |
| Angela Kaida                   |                     | 75.00              |                      | 75.00          |
| Ted Schrecker                  | 142.71              | 75.00              |                      | 217.71         |
| Lisa Eckenwiler                | 145.00              | 75.00              |                      | 220.00         |
| Christine Straehle (Organizer) | 131.94              | 75.00              | 1549.02              | 1755.96        |
| Patti Lenard                   | 190.00              | 75.00              |                      | 265.00         |
| Substitute                     |                     |                    |                      | \$0.00         |
| <b>Total:</b>                  |                     |                    |                      | <b>3963.89</b> |

## 2011 ISA Workshop Participants

Chair: Christine Straehle

| Affiliate ID (per<br>ISA HQs) | Participants       | Country | Membership Active<br>through Convention | Convention<br>Registration | Additional Notes                        |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|---------|---|----------------------------|---|
| 30420                         | Yukiko Asada       | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 13698                         | Garrett Brown      | UK      | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 26664                         | Ryoo Chung         | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 23242                         | Phillip Cole       | UK      | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 29338                         | Nicole Hassoun     | US      | Yes                                     | Yes                        | 10/12: May withdraw - insufficient fund |
| 30267                         | Matthew Hunt       | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 30298                         | Mira Johri         | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 29531                         | Angela Kaida       | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 16064                         | Ted Schrecker      | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
| 16781                         | Lisa Eckenwiler    | USA     | Yes                                     | Yes                        | Added 11/12                             |
|                               | Patl T Lenard      | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
|                               | Christine Straehle | Canada  | Yes                                     | Yes                        |   |
|                               | Substitute         |         |   |                            |   |